Letter to University of Toronto from
International Human Rights Clinics and Scholars

October 5, 2020

Dr. Meric S. Gertler
President, University of Toronto
27 King’s College Circle
Toronto, Ontario, Canada

cc: Professor Edward Iacobucci, Dean
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
78 Queens Park
Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Via email

Dear President Gertler,

We write as group of human rights clinical faculty, scholars and students throughout the world to express our serious concern about the recent allegations that a sitting judge and major donor interfered in the hiring process of the Director of the International Human Rights Program (IHRP) at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law (the “Law School”).

Media reports indicate that following a competitive hiring process, Dr. Valentina Azarova was unanimously selected by an expert hiring committee as the most qualified candidate to lead the Law School’s long-established and well-respected IHRP. We understand that Dr. Azarova accepted the Law School’s offer of employment in August 2020 through a Zoom call and was working out immigration logistics with the Law School to move from Germany to Canada when the offer was abruptly rescinded by the Law School Dean. Members of the hiring committee reported that they were not meaningfully informed or consulted before this turn of events. Credible reports indicate the about-face was the result of external pressure from a donor – a sitting judge of the Tax Court of Canada – who objected to aspects of Dr. Azarova’s human rights work. The Program’s entire faculty advisory committee resigned from the committee and a research associate on the hiring committee resigned from his job in protest after the Law School Dean refused to provide a sufficient and transparent explanation for what had occurred. Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch – two of the most significant and well-regarded international human rights organizations – have formally expressed concerns to the U of T and have called for an independent, external investigation. To date, the Law School and the University have not adequately explained the scandal.
It is hard to overstate how dangerous this development is for our work as human rights academics and clinicians and for academic freedom, the rule of law, and democracy more broadly. Commitment to academic freedom has long been a cornerstone of Canadian universities, and is essential for fostering open discussion and legitimate scholarly debate on topical and complex matters. Academic freedom is particularly crucial where human rights are concerned, as these rights can be controversial and forcefully opposed by powerful actors. The Supreme Court of Canada puts it succinctly in McKinney v University of Guelph: “academic freedom and excellence is necessary to our continuance as a lively democracy.” The Court’s astute observation is, unfortunately, not hypothetical. Threats to academic freedom are on the rise around the world, including in Canada, despite being protected by domestic laws and policies as well as international human rights norms.

International human rights law protects academic freedom in various ways. Members of the academic community, including a director of a human rights program, enjoy rights to freedom of opinion, freedom of expression, freedom of association and freedom of assembly. Moreover, international human rights law protects an individual’s right to receive a non-discriminatory education, which can only be enjoyed when accompanied by the academic freedom of faculty, staff and students. Together these rights enable members of the academic community to carry out their work without fear of discrimination or repression, including work that is controversial or challenging to the status quo. Finally, academic freedom requires that universities remain autonomous, meaning they are free from external pressure, while still being publicly accountable. We are gravely concerned that the University of Toronto’s recent conduct violates each of these principles.

Despite these basic human rights undergirding academic freedom, the University of Toronto now hides behind unconvincing technicalities rather than address these fundamental principles. Perplexingly, the University and Law School claim academic freedom should not apply to this senior position as it is a “staff” position rather than a “faculty” position. While we are concerned that classifying a position like this as “staff” itself evidences inappropriate concern for the issues we raise here, it is clear that international human rights law itself calls for academic freedom for this “staff” position. The United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights specifically notes in its General Comment 13 that all members of the academic community at institutions of higher education should receive the highest level of protection as “staff and students in higher education are especially vulnerable to political and other pressures which undermine academic freedom.” Indeed, it is difficult to conceive of a university position more in need of academic freedom than the director of a human rights program.

To ensure respect for the fundamental human rights underpinning academic freedom, academic institutions and their administrators are surely compelled to do at least as much to protect staff working on human rights issues as they do to protect tenured faculty. A human rights director’s work often involves far more political controversy than arises from the work of many tenured faculty. As this very incident demonstrates, the position is highly exposed to powerful actors who seek to shape education and dialogue to their desired message. The position calls for greater protection from external political pressure because of this reality, not less. The University and Law School’s failure to protect these basic principles is a grave warning to those of us working in this field and to the academy more broadly: it demonstrates that universally accepted rights are threatened within the walls of our most august institutions.
We are also deeply disappointed the Dean’s decision has undermined the ongoing work of the IHRP. The IHRP is “cherished” by students, undertakes important real-world work, partners widely with domestic and international organizations and helps bolster the University’s reputation as an institution supporting social progress. It is especially discouraging that the Law Dean has made this decision at a time when new challenges to human rights arise daily and all human rights defenders, including those in the IHRP, need to function at full capacity to respond.

That this scandal is taking place in one of Canada’s top law schools makes us wonder how we can trust the very institutions that are supposed to be teaching us about law, justice, fair process and inalienable rights. The University, and particularly the Law School, prides itself on teaching these concepts and training future lawyers to respect and embody the highest ideals of the legal profession. These institutions should thus be held to a high standard in complying with these laws and principles. Because it is their professional obligation to foster respect for justice, human rights, the rule of law, fairness, and transparency, it is incumbent upon all faculty and staff members to present themselves as exemplars of these values. This is especially true of those in leadership roles. Further, not only is the fact of academic freedom central to the university’s mission, the perception of academic freedom is equally crucial to ensure a vibrant intellectual community. We do not see the Law School’s actions – either in revoking Dr. Azarova’s offer or in inadequately responding to the wave of subsequent criticism – as consistent with these standards.

When the University of Toronto’s Law School bows to external interference, it fails to fulfill its purpose as a place that supports and develops the open and dynamic exchange of ideas – even controversial ones. This exchange is foundational not only to human rights clinics and other academic programs, but more generally to the rule of law and democracy. We thus add our voice to the growing calls for the immediate reinstatement of Dr. Azarova and for a transparent explanation of the controversy through an independent and impartial investigation. If this situation is not immediately rectified by the University of Toronto and the Law School, it will render the harm already done to the reputation of the IHRP irreparable and send a chill throughout human rights clinics and the academy at precisely the moment where this type of work is especially needed and increasingly under threat.

Now is the time for the University of Toronto and its Law School to demonstrate their commitment to preserving and protecting the very academic freedom and commitment to transparency that underpins the institution’s reputation as a respected leader in education. As human rights clinicians and scholars, we undertake as a collective to do our utmost to hold the University of Toronto and our own institutions to these universal standards.

Sincerely yours,
**International Human Rights Clinic Directors and Faculty**

**Anca Ailincai**  
Professeure de droit public  
Responsable de la clinique juridique en droit des libertés (Clinidroit)  
Responsable du Master 2 “Contentieux des droits fondamentaux”  
Faculté de droit, Université Grenoble-Alpes

**Susan Akram**  
Clinical Professor and Director International Human Rights Clinic  
Boston University School of Law

**Roxanna Altholz**  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, International Human Rights Law Clinic  
Berkeley Law

**Xavier Aurey**  
Lecturer  
President, Network of Francophone Law Clinics  
University of Essex, UK

**Sandra Babcock**  
Clinical Professor  
International Human Rights Clinic  
Cornell Law School

**Nicole Barrett**  
Director, International Justice & Human Rights Clinic  
Peter A. Allard School of Law  
University of British Columbia

**Elizabeth Brundige**  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, Gender Justice Clinic  
Cornell Law School

**Linde Bryk**  
Director, Amsterdam Law Clinics  
Amsterdam Law School  
University of Amsterdam

**Susan H. Farbstein**  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, International Human Rights Clinic  
Harvard Law School
Martin Flaherty  
Leitner Family Professor of International Human Rights  
Leitner Center for International Law and Justice  
Fordham Law School  

Laurel E. Fletcher  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Clinical Program Director  
Co-Director, International Human Rights Law Clinic  
Co-Faculty Director, Miller Institute for Global Challenges and the Law  
Berkeley Law School  

Hannah R. Garry  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, International Human Rights Clinic  
USC Gould School of Law  

Dr. Robert Heinsch, LL.M.  
Associate Professor of Public International Law &  
Director Leiden International Humanitarian Law Clinic  
Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies  
Leiden Law School, The Netherlands  

Salvador Herencia-Carrasco  
Director, Human Rights Clinic  
Human Rights Research and Education Centre  
University of Ottawa  

Deena R. Hurwitz  
Schell Center Senior Human Rights Fellow  
Yale Law School  

Sarah Knuckey  
Faculty co-director, Human Rights Institute  
Lieff Cabraser Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, Human Rights Clinic  
Columbia Law School  

Fannie Lafontaine  
Full Professor, Faculty of Law  
Founder & Co-Director, International Criminal and Humanitaire Law Clinic (CDIPH)  
Université Laval  

Dieudonné K. Kossi  
Doctorant en Droit Public / Assistant d’Enseignement  
Directeur de la Clinique d’Expertise Juridique et Sociale  
Faculté de Droit, Université de Lomé
Sarah Mehta  
Associate Research Scholar  
Human Rights Clinic & Institute  
Columbia Law School  

Priyanka Motaparthy  
Associate Research Scholar  
Human Rights Clinic & Institute  
Columbia Law School  

Reza Moradinejad  
Professeur adjoint  
Coresponsable de la clinique de rédaction législative  
Faculté de droit  
Université Laval  

Asthा Sharma Pokharel  
Clinical Teaching Fellow  
International Human Rights Law Clinic  
Berkeley Law School  

Martha Rayner  
Clinical Associate Professor of Law  
Fordham Law School  

Gulika Reddy  
Senior Clinical Teaching Fellow  
Human Rights Clinic  
Columbia Law School  

Mariana Olaizola Rosenblat  
Global Human Rights Clinic Fellow  
Lecturer in Law  
University of Chicago Law School  

Francisco J. Rivera Juaristi  
Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, International Human Rights Clinic  
Santa Clara Law  

Margaret Satterthwaite  
Professor of Clinical Law  
Director, Center for Human Rights and Global Justice  
New York University School of Law
James Silk  
Binger Clinical Professor of Human Rights  
Allard K. Lowenstein International Human Rights Clinic  
Director, Orville H. Schell, Jr. Center for International Human Rights  
Yale Law School

Maria Sokolova  
Junior Supervising Lawyer  
International Justice & Human Rights Clinic  
Peter A. Allard School of Law  
University of British Columbia

Cynthia Soohoo  
Co-Director Human Rights & Gender Justice Clinic  
CUNY School of Law

Érick Sullivan  
Lawyer  
Deputy Director, International Criminal and Humanitaire Law Clinic (CDIPH)  
Université Laval

Valériane Thool  
Lecturer  
Deputy-director, International Bureau of Legal Assistance (BAJI)  
Université de Sherbrooke

Ryan Thoreson  
Clinical Lecturer in Law  
Yale Law School

Salma Waheedi  
Human Rights Lawyer and Clinical Instructor  
International Human Rights Clinic  
Harvard Law School

JoAnn Kamuf Ward  
Director, Human Rights in the US Project, Human Rights Institute  
Supervisor, Human Rights Clinic  
Columbia Law School
**International Human Rights Scholars**

**Nadia Abu-Zahra**  
Associate Professor and Joint Chair in Women’s Studies at the University of Ottawa and Carleton University  
Steering Committee Member, Scholars at Risk, University of Ottawa  
Management Committee Member, Human Rights Research and Education Centre, University of Ottawa

**Kjell Anderson**  
Director, Master of Human Rights program  
Assistant Professor in Law  
University of Manitoba

**Larry Chartrand**  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Ottawa

**Florence Couillard**  
Coordonnatrice 2020-2021  
Réseau national d'étudiants Pro Bono - Section Université Laval  
Faculté de droit, Université Laval

**François Crépeau**  
Hans & Tamar Oppenheimer Professor of Public International Law  
Faculty of Law  
McGill University

**Emilio Dabed**  
Adjunct Professor  
Osgoode Law School  
York University, Toronto

**Amanda DiPaolo**  
Professor of Human Rights  
Chair, Human Rights Department  
St. Thomas University

**Helen Duffy**  
Professor of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law  
Director of Human Rights in Practice  
Leiden University, The Netherlands
Geneviève Dufour
Full Professor, Faculty of Law, and Lawyer (Quebec Bar)
Co-director, International Bureau of Legal Assistance (BAJI)
Université de Sherbrooke

Viviana Fernandez
Assistant Director
Human Rights Research and Education Centre
University of Ottawa

Amanda Ghahremani
International Criminal Lawyer
Research Associate, Simone de Beauvoir Institute at Concordia University
Co-Researcher, Canadian Partnership for International Justice

Julia Grignon
Full Professor, Faculty of Law
Co-Director, International Criminal and Humanitaire Law Clinic (CDIPH)
Université Laval

Emma Irving
Assistant Professor of Public International Law
Senior Supervisor of Kalshoven-Gieskes Forum International Humanitarian Law Clinic
Leiden University Law School

Mark Kersten
Researcher, Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy
University of Toronto
Senior Consultant, Wayamo Foundation

Tally Kritzman-Amir
Visiting Assistant Professor
Boston University School of Law

Frédéric Mégret
Full Professor and Dawson Scholar
Centre for Human Rights and Legal Pluralism
Faculty of Law
McGill University

Robin Pass
General Manager
Institute for International Law of Peace and Armed Conflict
Ruhr-University Bochum, Germany
David Pavot
Professor
Research chair on anti-doping in sports
Co-director, International Bureau of Legal Assistance (BAJI)
Université de Sherbrooke

Craig Scott
Professor of Law & Academic Director
International and Transnational Law Program
Osgoode Hall Law School of York University

Alain-Guy Sipowo
Lecturer
Laval University
McGill University and Sherbrooke University
Member of the Bar of Quebec

François Tanguay-Renaud
Associate Professor
Osgoode Hall Law School
Co-Director, Jack & Mae Nathanson Centre on Transnational Human Rights, Crime and Security
York University

Meredith Terretta
Gordon F. Henderson Chair in Human Rights
Human Rights Research and Education Centre
University of Ottawa

Joao Velloso
Assistant Professor
Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa
Member of the Steering Committee of Scholars at Risk - uOttawa

International Human Rights Student Clinicians

Jeanne Dileseigres
Student Clinician, Master 2 “Human Rights Litigation”
University of Grenoble-Alpes

Alex Farrant
Student, IJHR Clinic
University of British Columbia

Agathe Feuillard-Hatton
Student Clinician, Master 2 “Human Rights Litigation”
University of Grenoble-Alpes
Nicolas Huertas
Student
Allard School of Law
University of British Columbia

Imalka Nilmalgoda
Student, IJHR Clinic
Peter A. Allard School of Law
University of British Columbia

Diego Arias Sevilla
Clinician student
Master 2 Contentieux des droits fondamentaux
Université Grenoble Alpes

Harkeerit Shokar
Student
International Justice & Human Rights Clinic
University of British Columbia

Gillian Thiel
Student
International Justice and Human Rights Clinic, UBC

Christine Yan
Student Clinician
International Justice & Human Rights Clinic (UBC)

Mathilde Besse
Student Clinician, Master 2 “Human Rights Litigation”
University of Grenoble-Alpes